

**FINAL MINUTES
APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE MEETING
Thursday, August 15, 2013 1:00 P.M.**

Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order by Mike Petrus, as the acting Application Review Committee Chair at 1:00 P.M.

Committee members present at roll call:

Mike Petrus
Mark Keller

Absent at roll call:

James Heaslet and Frank Ugenti

Staff Attendance:

Jeanne Galvin – Assistant Attorney General
Debra Rudd -- Executive Director
Jessica Sapio - Staff

Item III. A. Application AL 12019 – Robert Borbeck to be reviewed for the first time.

After discussion about what could be completed on the agenda, Mike Petrus called the first item to consider the application for AL 12019 – Robert Borbeck. Mr. Borbeck was in attendance at this meeting. After discussion, Mike Petrus made a motion to recommend approval to the full board of his application. Mark Keller seconded the motion. The motion carried.

Item III. C. Application AG11616 – Tracy Y. Johnson

He then called the next attendee, Tracy Y. Johnson AG11616. Mike Petrus questioned Ms. Johnson about her past appraisal history. She explained that she was a Certified General Appraiser in Florida for several years and moved to Arizona a few years ago, after taking a job with the Maricopa County Assessor's Office. She let her certification lapse in Florida as it was not necessary to have a certificate here for her job. She recently changed employment and was now seeking a certification here.

1:10 p.m. Frank Ugenti joined the meeting.

The committee members resumed questioning Ms. Johnson about her experience, her appraisal designation, and current status of employment. Mike Petrus stated he had no problems with the reports other than he was concerned about her signature on the reports. Mark Keller stated he did not see anywhere that she said she was a licensed appraiser in the reports. The Committee members acknowledged that she had 30 years of experience as an appraiser, and that her signature on these reports should not disqualify her. Mike Petrus made a motion to recommend approval of her application. Frank Ugenti seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Item II D regarding revising the Appraisal Management Company application

Mike Petrus called the Committee's attention to the item regarding disclosures on Appraisal Management Companies. Jeanne Galvin proposed that the application be reworded in such a way to only require the final decisions on litigation, or complaints in lieu of the current method which required disclosure of pending complaints and litigation. After discussion, Frank Ugenti made a motion for the committee to recommend to the full board that staff revise the applications for AMC's to include only the final decisions on litigation and complaints. Mark Keller seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Item II E. relating to the request by Greg Shield for special consideration.

Mr. Shield alleged that the Board improperly processed his application in 2005 for Certified Residential classification by issuing him a License instead of a certification. He requested special consideration be given to him now. Jessica Sapio gave the history behind this allegation to the members of the committee. After discussion by the members, Frank Ugenti made a motion to recommend to the full board that they deny his request. Mark Keller seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

Item II C. regarding Harry Feltman's failure to submit a timely engagement form for his trainee, Michael Sarysz.

Mr. Sarysz was present. He reported that this failure to file resulted in approximately 240 hours of experience not being allowed. Mr. Sarysz gave the committee his background, which included his previous experience as a trainee with Angus Hopkins, who had passed away. Mr. Feltman started to train him back in 2006 after Mr. Hopkins death, but due to the market change, he could not continue training at that time. Mr. Sarysz went to work in a different area of real estate. After discussion, the committee decided to take no action on recommending the Board to open a complaint against Mr. Feltman for his failure to file the form in a timely fashion. Frank Ugenti then made a motion to recommend denial of the request for the hours to be counted, and Mark Keller seconded the motion. On the voice vote, the motion carried, with 2 ayes and 1 abstained. Mike Petrus abstained from the vote.

Approval of the minutes for the July 13th meeting,

Frank Ugenti moved to approve the minutes of the meeting. Mike Petrus seconded the motion. The motion passed, with Mark Keller abstaining from the vote.

Item II F. regarding revising the due dates for applications to be submitted

Mike Petrus explained that he requested this item be added to the agenda to allow the committee members more time to review the appraisals submitted with applications. Jessica Sapio explained the current rules and statute about processing the applications. The office has 45 days to process the application to find it substantively complete after their submission of their reports. After much discussion, the committee requested obtaining the information earlier than what they have been receiving them. Debra Rudd discussed the request by members to only receive one disk and that this may create a problem for staff. Jeanne Galvin summarized their request to be 30 days before the committee meeting to obtain the information so that the members may review the appraisals in a timely fashion. Consensus by the committee confirmed this summary. Mike Petrus asked that the staff to work toward giving the committee members at least three weeks prior to the meeting to review the files.

The committee then went off the record to consider the files.

Item III B. Application AR12009 Dawn R. Tomlinson

Mark Keller questioned the adjustment for the guest house for the appraisal on the property located on E Shea Blvd. Mike Petrus pointed out that we are not questioning the amount, but the support for the adjustment. Mike Petrus wants to ask the appraiser for support on the garage adjustment for the property on 103rd Street. Frank Ugenti had questions about the view adjustments on the appraisal. There is also a question about a licensed appraiser signing a complex appraisal, as is the case of the property on Shea Blvd. Upon further discussion, Frank Ugenti made a motion to invite the appraiser and the supervisor in to discuss these items with the committee. Mark Keller seconded the motion. Mike Petrus agreed that he wanted both the trainee and supervisor to attend the meeting to discuss these appraisals. All voted in favor of this motion.

Item III B. Application AR12003 Jeffrey M. Wright

Mr. Wright disclosed on his application that he had a complaint with California's Office of Real Estate Appraisers and a DPS background hit. The staff has reviewed the complaint, and that it has been dismissed. After discussion, the committee's consensus was to recommend approval of the application to the full board.

Frank Ugenti recused himself from Items under V. on the agenda, regarding the AMC Renewal Applications for #40015, Prime Valuation Services and #40016 RELs Valuation.

After going back off the record to review the rest of the files, they then came back on the record to discuss the rest of the agenda. Mike Petrus reported that the committee by consensus was going to recommend **approval of the applications previously discussed, and those under III B. AR12017 Jessica M. Hoogs, AG12028 Stephen R. Elson, and AG12048 Patrick A. Wilson.** They also recommend approval of all items under IV, V, VI, VII and the Consent Agenda under IX.

The meeting adjourned at 2:30 p.m.